

# After the Boats Stopped: Refugees Managing a Life of Protracted Limbo in Indonesia

Thomas Brown<sup>1</sup>

## Abstract

*In 2013, Australia enacted tough border policies to “stop the boats”, leaving Indonesia to play host to a burgeoning number of refugees who now spend years, rather than months in the country, awaiting resettlement through the UNHCR to a third country. In Indonesia, asylum seekers live in a state of limbo and are deprived of access to education and employment. Given the uncertainty and increasing length of stay, the question emerges: how do people manage their lives in response to this protracted, yet impermanent, situation? In particular, how do refugees build relations with one another and with their Indonesian hosts? In West Java, Hazara refugees from Afghanistan respond to their uncertain situation by forming a strong co-ethnic community to navigate their new environment. Even though these urban refugees live in and amongst Indonesian host communities, they have little meaningful interaction with Indonesians and demonstrate very little uptake of the language, behaviours or cultural practices of their neighbours. This phenomenon of forming a community within, but at the same time apart from the host community is demonstrated with primary data collected over a six-week period in West Java using a combination of participant observation and interview methods. Based on comparison with other urban refugee contexts and ethnic Hazara diaspora groups, it is argued that the extent to which refugees form bonds with the local population is dependent on structural factors, in particular the formal and informal legal framework for refugees, access to education and employment, cultural and linguistic differences, and discrimination.*

**Keywords:** Refugees, Asylum Seekers, Acculturation, Hazara

## Abstrak

*Pada tahun 2013, Australia menerapkan kebijakan perbatasan yang semakin ketat menghalau masuknya kapal-kapal pengungsi. Ini menyebabkan Indonesia harus menampung lonjakan jumlah pengungsi yang sekarang harus menghabiskan kurun masa penantian bukan dalam bulanan, tapi tahunan, untuk mendapat penempatan ke negara ketiga melalui UNHCR. Di Indonesia, para pengungsi berada dalam situasi ketidakpastian dan tanpa akses ke pendidikan maupun pekerjaan. Di tengah ketidakpastian dan semakin lamanya masa penantian, sebuah pertanyaan muncul: bagaimana para pengungsi harus mengatur hidup mereka di tengah situasi yang berkepanjangan tetapi tidak permanen ini? Secara lebih khusus, bagaimana para pengungsi membangun hubungan di antara sesama mereka dan masyarakat setempat? Di Jawa Barat, para pengungsi dari Afghanistan menghadapi situasi ketidakpastian ini dengan membentuk sebuah komunitas ko-etnik yang kuat untuk mengarungi lingkungan baru mereka. Meski para pengungsi urban ini hidup di tengah-tengah masyarakat Indonesia setempat, mereka memiliki sedikit hubungan yang berarti dan tidak banyak menyerap kemampuan bahasa, perilaku maupun praktik budaya dari tetangga mereka. Fenomena pembentukan sebuah komunitas di dalam, tapi terpisah dari, masyarakat tuan rumah setempat ditelaah dari pengumpulan data selama enam bulan di Jawa Barat melalui kombinasi metode pengamatan terlibat dan wawancara. Berdasarkan perbandingan dengan konteks komunitas pengungsi urban lainnya maupun diaspora etnik Hazara secara lebih luas, argumen yang akan dikemukakan adalah bahwa sedalam apa para pengungsi membentuk ikatan dengan masyarakat tuan rumah setempat sangat bergantung pada faktor-faktor struktural, khususnya kerangka legal formal maupun informal yang tersedia bagi pengungsi, akses ke pendidikan dan pekerjaan, perbedaan budaya dan bahasa, dan diskriminasi.*

---

<sup>1</sup> Thomas Brown conducted this research while based at Universitas Katolik Parahyangan. He was originally based at the University of Adelaide. [Thomas.brown@student.adelaide.edu.au](mailto:Thomas.brown@student.adelaide.edu.au)

## Introduction

In recent decades, Indonesia has become an important transit point for asylum seekers, typically from the Middle East, who seek to reach Australia via UNHCR resettlement channels or by ‘irregular means’: in other words, by boat. In 2013, Australia toughened its border policies, in particular through the introduction of the military-led *Operation Sovereign Borders* designed to, according to government rhetoric, ‘stop the boats’. These policies have all but stopped asylum seekers reaching Australian territory, but in doing so have created a ‘bottleneck’, with Indonesia left to play host to a burgeoning number of asylum seekers and refugees (ASRs) who now spend years, rather than months, in the country. While their lives may not be at risk, the time that ASRs spend in Indonesia is plagued by uncertainty, and their basic human rights and economic, social, and psychological needs can remain unfulfilled. Indonesia’s recent shift from a short-term transit country to a place where more than 14,000 ASRs spend an increasing amount of time necessitates enquiry into how ASRs manage their lives in Indonesia.

Indonesia is not a signatory to the 1951 Refugee Convention or the 1967 Protocol, and as such does not formally recognise refugees. The Indonesian government has authorised the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) to be the body responsible for ASRs during their stay in Indonesia, and has decreed that they may be allowed to remain in Indonesia until they can be resettled in a third country. There are no pathways available for refugees to settle in Indonesia. Furthermore, refugees in Indonesia are not permitted to work and have limited access to education and affordable healthcare.

At the time of writing, around half of Indonesia’s asylum seeker and refugee population was from Afghanistan (UNHCR 2016b). Although data on the ethnicity of refugees is not collected, it is widely understood that most of these Afghan refugees are ethnic Hazaras. Hazaras are Persian-

speaking Shia Muslims who are both ethnic and religious minorities in Afghanistan, making up around 9 percent of the total population (Bacon 1951; MacKenzie and Guntarik 2015). The group has faced an extended history of persecution, dating back to 1890, when the Pashtun Sunni leader of Afghanistan, Emir Abdur Rahman, led incursions to massacre Shia Hazaras as part of a jihad or ‘holy war’ (MacKenzie and Guntarik 2015). More recently, the instability and conflict that has plagued Afghanistan, in particular the rise of the Taliban, an extremist Sunni group that targeted the Shia Hazaras, has led to mass exodus of Hazaras from the country (Emadi 1997; Human Rights Watch 2001; Creasy 2008). Early waves of forced migration saw large populations settling in Pakistan and Iran, countries that now host around 650,000 and one million Hazaras respectively (MacKenzie and Guntarik 2015). More recently, Hazara refugees have been resettled in Australia, North America, Europe, New Zealand and Australia (SBS 2013).

This paper focuses on Hazara ASRs living in urban centres of Puncak, West Java. The primary data collected during the author’s field study demonstrates that while they live in and amongst the Indonesian population, Hazara refugees remain socially isolated from their hosts. They respond to their protracted situation by forming a strong ethnic community that is distinctly separate from that of their Indonesian counterparts. In particular, they have little meaningful contact with the host population and do not adopt the language, behaviours or cultural practices of their neighbours. This paper compares the behaviour of Hazaras in Indonesia with diaspora populations in Pakistan, Iran, and Australia, and argues that the extent to which refugees form bonds with the local population – that is, the extent to which they integrate – depends on structural factors within the host countries. In particular, in Indonesia, a restrictive legal framework, lack of access to education and employment, cultural and linguistic differences, and discrimination can be seen to inhibit refugees’ ability to form meaningful relationships with the

host community and as such be influenced by the host culture.

This paper will begin by giving an overview of existing literature on how refugees manage their lives in urban contexts around the world, concerning refugees in Indonesia as well as the Hazara diaspora living in Pakistan, Iran and Australia. Using the concepts of bridging and bonding social capital, the paper will then describe how urban refugees in Indonesia form relationships with one another as well as with the host community. Finally, an analysis of structural factors in Indonesia, as well as other contexts, will be provided as a means to understand this behaviour.

Since most Hazara asylum seekers in Indonesia eventually gain refugee status with the UNHCR, the term refugee will be used to refer to both asylum seekers awaiting the outcome of their refugee status determination, as well as those who have been deemed refugees by the UNHCR (UNHCR 2016a).

### **Urban refugees**

In contrast to typical images of isolated detention centres and refugee camps, more than half of the world's refugees now live in urban environments in and amongst host populations. In addition, refugees are increasingly disproportionately hosted by developing countries, with 86 percent of the world's refugees living in the global South, compared to 70 percent ten years ago (UNHCR nd. b). The increasing number of forced migrants living in heterogeneous urban centres of the developing world has increased the demand for knowledge and data on urban refugees (Lyytinen & Kullenberg 2013).

Kofi Kobia and Leilla Cranfield conducted a review of existing literature on urban refugees in 2009, and found that the 'the available literature makes it difficult to truly grasp the global landscape for urban refugees'. They found that most fieldwork is conducted by a small community of researchers, and that the

majority of the literature focuses on three African cities: Cairo, Nairobi and Johannesburg. A more recent literature review on urban refugees was conducted by Eveliina Lyytinen and Janosch Kullenberg in 2013. While comprehensive, their study still focuses heavily on African cities, with a few isolated case studies on Jordan, Lebanon, Syria, India and Pakistan (Lyytinen & Kullenberg 2013). In addition, the existing research on urban refugees is limited in scope, in that it typically focuses on those taking refuge in neighbouring countries from the same region. As such, the population of Hazara refugees from Afghanistan living among an Indonesian population in urban areas of West Java makes for an illuminating case study to contribute to the literature on urban refugees in developing countries, particularly in those outside Africa.

In addition to the limited geographic scope of the existing research, it is important to consider the themes that are explored. Lyytinen & Kullenberg (2013) comment that within the literature on urban refugees 'very little is currently known about refugees' participation in local communities where they can engage with the hosts and other migrants'. The research presented in this paper addresses this literature gap by providing insight into how urban refugees in Indonesia form relationships with one another as well as with the host community.

The literature on refugees in Indonesia, in turn, has largely focused on international law and protection frameworks (Tan 2016; Taylor & Raffery-Brown 2010), refugees as an issue in the context of the Australia-Indonesia bilateral relationship (Kneebone 2017; Missbach 2015c; Nethery & Gordyn 2014; Taylor 2012), on the people-smuggling trade (McNevin, Missbach & Deddy 2016; Missbach 2016b; Missbach 2015b; Missbach & Crouch 2013), or on refugees in detention (Missbach 2016a; Nethery, Rafferty-Brown, Taylor 2012). Some important primary research has been conducted on the way refugees manage their lives independently in urban areas of Indonesia. In particular, Antje Missbach in her book *Troubled Transit* (2015) touches on

refugees' relationships with one another and the host community in Puncak, drawing on the experience of a number of months spent living there in 2012. Sampson, Gifford and Taylor (2016) also write on how refugees manage a life in 'transit' in different parts of Indonesia, but their research was conducted in 2009. The context was considerably different at the time the data for these two texts was collected, when refugees in Indonesia were fewer in number and the irregular movement of migrants to Australia was still ongoing. This paper builds on existing research by presenting the first in-depth primary research on how refugees manage their lives in Indonesia *since* the recent Australian border policy changes that have ended the irregular movement of asylum seekers to Australia and left them in a more protracted situation. It is also one of the few studies to focus exclusively on a group of urban refugees in a single geographic area in Indonesia, in this case Puncak, West Java.

### **Social capital and tension in urban refugee contexts**

Social capital is an important concept in the study of how immigrants and refugees manage their lives in a new country (Lyytinen & Kullenberg 2013). Social capital can be defined as 'social networks and associated norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness' (Putnam, 2007). In the context of urban refugees in heterogeneous host communities, two forms of social capital are important: *bonding* social capital, or social networks among refugees of the same ethnicity or country of origin; and *bridging* social capital, or ties between refugees and the host community.

Noel Calhoun (2010) explores the theme of social capital among refugees from Iraq, Sudan and Somalia living in urban areas in Jordan. He scores both forms of social capital by investigating a number of categories including collective action, trust in lending/borrowing, social ties, mutual support, friendship and information networks. He found that bonding social capital was stronger than bridging social

capital for all refugees living in Jordan, but that significant variation existed in the level of bridging and bonding social capital among refugees from different countries of origin.

Calhoun found that Iraqi refugees in Jordan have greater bridging social capital than other refugee groups, most probably because they have greater linguistic, ethnic and cultural affinities with the host population. Among non-Iraqis, Calhoun found that Sudanese refugees have strong bonding capital with much weaker bridging capital, and that Somali refugees, while having the strongest level of bonding social capital, with a strong culture of mutual support, demonstrated 'absolutely no bridging social capital', choosing to 'live together in a compact geographic area'. According to Calhoun, the experience of Somali refugees in Jordan may be attributed to the fact that they experience racism and discrimination in public places, and many do not speak Arabic well. This phenomenon of forming a strong but isolated refugee community mirrors the experience of Hazara refugees living in Puncak, West Java.

### **Hazara diaspora in Pakistan, Iran and Australia**

A number of studies exist on Hazara communities living outside of Afghanistan, in particular on diasporas living in urban areas of Pakistan, Iran and Australia, each of which presents a distinct context for refugees. Pakistan and Iran have acted as semi-permanent hosts for ethnic Hazaras fleeing persecution in recent decades. While not having formalised rights in these countries, Hazara refugees are able to work and study, and their close proximity to Afghanistan has enabled them to maintain strong social ties to home.

Hassan Poladi, a second-generation Pakistani Hazara, wrote *The Hazaras* in 1989. He noted that the Hazara community in the city of Quetta remained quite closed off from their non-Shia Pakistani counterparts, and steadfastly maintained their ethnic culture and identity:



'Hazaras have kept their identity as pure as possible; by and large Hazaras are operative as a closed group with almost no affinity with people of other religious and ethnic groups' (Poladi as quoted by Creasy 2009). Another scholar who has undertaken a sociological and historical study of the Hazaras, Sayed Askar Mousavi, draws a similar conclusion, stating that Hazaras in Pakistan 'maintained to a large extent a strong sense of their origins and traditional identity, along with their tribal and social structure' (Mousavi 1998 as quoted by Creasy 2009). Social tension and discrimination are commonly understood to inhibit integration in urban refugee contexts (World Vision 2015; Berry 2005). This is likely a contributing factor to the apparent isolation of Hazaras in Pakistan, where they face extreme discrimination and persecution at the hands of militant Sunni groups. Between 2008 and 2014, more than 500 Hazaras lost their lives in sectarian attacks in Pakistan carried out by the Taliban and their allies (HRW 2014).

Hazara refugees living in Iran have been able to form bonds with the local population, aided by the commonality of language and religion they share with Persian-speaking Shia Iranians. A 2005 study from the Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit, an independent think tank based in Kabul, indicates that relations between refugees and their neighbours are relatively robust, with examples of strong relationships and support between ethnic groups (Abbasi-Shavazi *et al.* 2005; Monsutti 2004). Many Hazaras in Iran establish close co-ethnic communities, but are also able to form positive relationships with Iranians – both horizontal networks, such as neighbours, and workmates, and vertical networks, such as landlords, shopkeepers, and employers (Abbasi-Shavazi and Glazebrook 2006). At the same time, there are discriminatory attitudes toward Hazara refugees in Iran, where refugees are seen as a drain on the economy and a source of instability. In particular, respondents from the aforementioned Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit referred to cases of theft and discrimination from Iranians, and experienced

anxiety about being deported (Abbasi-Shavazi *et al.* 2005).

In contrast to Pakistan and Iran, Australia is a so-called *destination country* for refugees, with citizenship and formal rights available to those who are accepted as part of the country's humanitarian intake program.<sup>2</sup> Some 20,000 Hazaras live in Australia, with more than half found in the city of Melbourne (MacKenzie and Guntarik 2015). A large number of these are concentrated in Dandenong, with an estimated 12,000 Hazaras living in this suburb (Nowell, 2014). The Hazara community in Dandenong is very active, with the existence of youth groups, music and theatre groups, sporting groups, and other community activities (Nowell, 2014). Despite developing strong bonding social capital with one another, Hazaras in Australia appear to have been successful in forming bonds with the local population, and have taken on distinctly Australian characteristics. The Hazaras interviewed by MacKenzie and Guntarik (2015) demonstrate their acquisition of social and cultural capital through language development, familiarity with local customs, and participation in civic life. One observed phenomenon was the use of linguistic signifiers of integration by the Hazara respondents, including the ability to confidently speak English with an Australian accent and the incorporation of distinctly Australian mannerisms, colloquialisms and humour. Through their interviews, respondents expressed core Australian values of active citizenship, egalitarianism and participatory democracy. Finally, the respondents sought to contribute to Australian civic life through volunteer work with community groups and roles in political and public spheres. Therefore, Hazaras living in Australia can be seen to maintain their cultural identity and enjoy close relations with other Hazaras in the community, whilst also acquiring social and cultural capital in Australia and developing a distinct Australian Hazara identity.

<sup>2</sup> With the notable exception of bridging visas, which contain certain prohibitions on work and do not guarantee a path to citizenship.

While all three of the described Hazara diaspora communities have high levels of bonding social capital, there appears to be some variability in their ability to form ties with the local population and in their uptake of local cultural practices and behaviours. This indicates that the extent to which Hazara refugees are able to integrate into a new country depend on a range of factors specific to that country. This paper contributes to the existing literature on Hazara diaspora with a qualitative study of Hazara refugees living in a compact geographic area of Indonesia. It argues that factors such as lack of access to education and employment, cultural and linguistic differences, discrimination, and legal status in Indonesia inhibit refugees' ability to form meaningful relationships with the host population, and thereby to be influenced by the behaviours and cultural practices of their neighbours.

### **Hazara refugees in West Java**

As of January 2017, there were 14,425 refugees and asylum seekers and refugees in Indonesia (Kemenko Polhukam 2017). Approximately four thousand live in immigration detention centres across thirteen provinces from North Sumatra to West Timor (Kemenko Polhukam 2017; UNHCR 2016b). The International Organization for Migration operates some 42 community housing facilities across Indonesia (IOM nd.), with 4,225 ASRs now living in such facilities, mostly concentrated in the cities of Makassar, Medan and Jakarta (Kemenko Polhukam 2017). The remaining ASRs in Indonesia are permitted to live independently in urban areas in Jakarta and West Java. The Indonesian context for refugees is distinct from that of Pakistan, Iran and Australia. In particular, refugees living in the community in Indonesia are strictly forbidden to work and have limited access to education and affordable healthcare.

The UNHCR (2017) estimates that there are 2,512 refugees living in the greater Bogor area in West Java. The majority of these are ethnic

Hazaras from Afghanistan, Pakistan or Iran, who have settled in urban centres of Puncak, a mountainous district near the city of Bogor. Most live in the townships of Cisarua and Cipayung, among Indonesians who are predominantly Sundanese-speaking Sunni Muslims. Unlike other refugees in Indonesia, who may be supported by international or local caretaker groups, refugees in Puncak live with relative independence, relying on personal savings or remittances from family members who live overseas.

### **Methodology**

The data for this paper was collected in 2015 and 2016 through participatory research among the ethnic Hazara refugee community of Cisarua. After a brief visit in September 2015, I conducted fieldwork over four weeks in October and November 2015. This involved immersive participatory observation conducted while living with a group of eight Hazara men who were renting a three-bedroom house located above the Indonesian landlord's family home. These men were from Afghanistan and Pakistan, with ages ranging from 20 to 35, in addition to a 65-year-old man. One man had a wife and child in Afghanistan, but the remainder were bachelors. These men acted as my entry point to the refugee community in Cisarua. Purposive respondent-driven sampling, or 'snowball sampling', was used to recruit more refugee participants. This is a sampling methodology commonly used by social researchers to penetrate hard-to-reach populations, and was useful in reaching refugees who can be well-hidden in urban environments (Atkinson and Flint 2001). Much of my time was spent in refugee education centers, which offered opportunities to access respondents from more varied backgrounds – in particular young women and families. Several brief multi-day return visits were undertaken in 2016, in addition to regular correspondence with key respondents remotely via email and telephone.

The primary data presented in this paper

demonstrates that while Hazara refugee communities steadfastly maintain their own culture and build strong communities to support one another, they have little meaningful contact with the host population and demonstrate very little uptake of the language, behaviours or cultural practices of their neighbours. The data reveals that structural factors, such as a lack of access to education and employment, cultural and linguistic differences, discrimination, and a liminal legal status, are the principal drivers for this behaviour.

### **A Community Within: Strong bonding social capital amongst refugees**

It is common for newly arrived immigrants from the same ethnic group, country, or even region of origin to seek each other out, as this can ease the transition to life in the new country. Ethnic enclaves are a common feature of immigrant communities all around the world, as localised social networks can support social and economic development (Danzer and Yaman, 2012). This is the case for the population of ethnic Hazaras that has congregated in Puncak, West Java. Hazaras will often say they are attracted to the area by its cooler climate and low cost of living compared to Jakarta, but above all else by the possibility of living in close proximity with co-ethnics who have the same background and speak the same language. As with other Hazara diasporas in Iran, Pakistan and Australia, as well as other refugees living in heterogeneous urban settings, Hazara refugees form strong co-ethnic communities in Puncak. This allows them to maintain a sense of cultural identity, feel supported and less lonely, and to more easily navigate the significant challenges of life as a refugee in Indonesia.

The apparent strength of bonding social capital between Hazara refugees in West Java is reflected in examples of collective initiatives that serve the community, the persistence of informal collective community activities, and a general culture of support. A number of refugee-led

initiatives have emerged in Puncak to provide much-needed facilities and services for the refugee community. These examples of self-organisation have emerged despite considerable barriers - namely, the poor protection framework in Indonesia, which in its ambiguity, hampers self-organisation and community activities by fear of prosecution.

There are four refugee-led education initiatives in Puncak. The first was the Cisarua Refugee Learning Centre (CRLC), established by four Hazara men in August 2014. While most are not professional educators, members of the refugee community serve as teachers and administrators. Other members of the community are often called upon to lend their skills in cleaning, maintenance and building activities, and the parents of children are involved in decision-making within the schools through regular meetings. Since the CRLC was established, three additional schools have emerged in Puncak following a similar model.

While the facilities provide vital education to around two hundred children, they also serve as makeshift community hubs, with English classes for adults, community-based health workshops, vocational skill-sharing programs and arts and handicrafts classes for women. Sports programs are also a very strong feature of the learning centres, particularly their football activities, with regular trainings and matches for both boys and girls.

The Refugee Women Support Group Indonesia is another group of interest established by a young Hazara woman. The group has a focus on textiles and jewellery making, and provides a space for women to gather and socialise amongst themselves. The group also runs workshops on women's issues, including health and hygiene, reproductive health, sexual and gender-based violence, and family planning.<sup>3</sup> Another refugee-led initiative is the Cisarua Refugee Shotokan Karate Club, established by a young Hazara woman who was a professional karate athlete in

<sup>3</sup> Refugee Women Support Facebook Page, accessed 25th November 2015

Afghanistan but fled the country after threats from extremist groups related to the mixed-gender karate school she operated.

There are also many informal initiatives and examples of self-support in the Hazara community in Puncak that point to a strong bonding social capital. Many refugees who have a good grasp of English will travel to private houses to teach groups of adults or adolescents who are over the age serviced by the refugee schools. Often these students themselves will in turn teach younger or less experienced individuals. Refugees with strong English proficiency are also called upon to assist in translation for hospital visits, negotiations with landlords or interactions with the UNHCR.

Sporting activities are another well-established informal pastime for Hazaras in Puncak. Most men, who typically have little to do otherwise, play football or work out at a local gym every day. There are several indoor football facilities and gyms, which are used almost exclusively by Hazara refugees. These activities act as important social gatherings, not only amongst the participants but also spectators, many of whom will gather to watch the football matches each day.

The existence of formalised refugee-led initiatives amongst ethnic Hazara refugees, as well as the strength of informal activities and self-support in Puncak, reflects high strong bonding social capital.

### **A Community Apart: Low bridging social capital**

For refugees, bridging social capital with the host community can have a range of benefits, helping them to feel less foreign and isolated, providing information that can aid them in solving problems and accessing services, and providing protection in case of disputes (Lyytinen & Kullenberg 2013). Despite the high levels of bonding social capital within the Hazara community in West Java, there is almost no bridging social capital between this community

and the local Indonesian population. A study conducted with a variety of refugees across six locations in Indonesia between 2012 and 2014 revealed that 67.2 percent did not socialise with Indonesians, 18.5 percent socialised on occasion, while only 14.3 percent socialised on a regular basis (Hugo *et al.* 2014). The situation observed during the six weeks of fieldwork in Puncak reflected an even lower level of engagement with Indonesians. Even though refugees live among the Indonesian population, interaction of any kind appeared limited entirely to necessity. ASRs interact only with those Indonesians providing services, such as landlords, local community representatives known as *Ketua Rukun Tetangga (RT)* and local shopkeepers, and no evidence of meaningful personal relationships developing outside these contexts was observed.

This lack of bonding social capital is reflected in Hazara refugees' very limited uptake of the language, behaviours and cultural practices of those around them in West Java. While Hazaras in Australia adopt language, humour and mannerisms from those around them (MacKenzie and Guntarik 2015), and many Hazaras in Pakistan are able to speak Urdu, in Puncak most Hazara refugees exhibit almost no evidence of integration. Instead, they spend their time together maintaining their own cultural practices and familiar pastimes, and look to Western culture as they anticipate their lives after being resettled from Indonesia.

Rather than engaging in Indonesian cultural activities, Hazara refugees preferred to socialise with one another and maintain more familiar traditions. Hazara men would regularly congregate for social gatherings, centred around home cooked meals, tea drinking, or, on more special occasions, to perform traditional *Harazagi* songs and dance. The *dambura*, a type of lute from Afghanistan, is popular amongst Hazara refugees in Puncak. The percussive *tabla* is another common instrument, and one refugee also played the *harmonium*, a variation on an accordion used in Afghanistan.

An enduring preference for traditional



food, rather than local Indonesian cuisine, was observed during the field study in Puncak. In six weeks of fieldwork the author never witnessed Hazaras eating Indonesian food, initially assuming that this was in order to save money. However, a Hazara respondent later explained that consumption of traditional Hazara food was in fact more expensive, as it involved the use of imported ingredients such as basmati rice and certain spices. This respondent indicated that in over a year living in Indonesia, he had never once eaten Indonesian food. Whether in family units or groups of bachelors, Hazara households in Puncak prepared all their own food. A typical diet included flatbread, rice, lentils and vegetables, as well as drinking spiced tea (*chai*) between mealtimes. Flatbread is baked fresh each morning, and yoghurt and cheese are also produced from scratch. Some families even had tandoor ovens, commonly found in Central Asia but a rare sight in Indonesia. Interestingly, the local KFC in Puncak was a seemingly popular site for dining out amongst Hazara refugees, signaling an affinity for Western food. Although *ayam goreng*, a similar and more affordable variant of fried chicken, is available at many local Indonesian restaurants, street stalls or *warungs* in the area, consumption of this food by Hazara refugees appears to be rare. The choice to prepare traditional food or to eat Western food instead of Indonesian food despite the apparent additional expense is a poignant demonstration of the Hazara refugees' resistance to engaging in the cultural practices of their neighbours in Puncak.

The majority of Hazaras in Puncak encountered during fieldwork speak a very basic level of Indonesian, which is largely limited to day-to-day vocabulary such as making use of motorbike taxis or public transport, or shopping at the market. A significant number of refugees, particularly those in family units, appeared to struggle to speak Indonesian at all. Instead, English is the preferred language to communicate with those outside the Hazara community, even with Indonesians. Given that there are no pathways to settling in Indonesia and their time in the country

is limited, most refugees are more motivated to learn English rather than Indonesian, as they feel it will help them once they are resettled to a third country.

As such, although Hazara refugees are able to develop strong social capital amongst themselves, they fail to build meaningful relations with their Indonesian hosts and show little evidence of adapting their way of life during their stay.

#### Discussion: Sources of social exclusion

The data presented in this paper suggests that Hazara refugees living in West Java exhibit high bonding social capital, while failing to demonstrate meaningful bridging social capital between themselves and the Indonesian host community, or any significant uptake of the behaviours or cultural practices of those around them. In other words, they form a tightly knit Hazara community that is isolated from the host community.

The question then emerges: why do Hazara refugees live in a community apart from their Indonesian hosts? Although a similar phenomenon takes place among Hazara diaspora communities in Pakistan, it is not consistent with those in Iran who are able to form positive relationships with their hosts, and those in Australia who demonstrate positive indicators of integration.

A number of structural factors inhibit the integration of refugees in Indonesia. Firstly, refugees are unable to engage in employment or the Indonesian education system during their time in Indonesia. Participation in local schooling and the job market has been found to be a key factor in enabling integration, but this organic means of socialisation remains unavailable to refugees in Indonesia (Erdogan 2012).

A lack of cultural and linguistic similarity is another factor that inhibits the development of bridging social capital for Hazara refugees from Central Asia who find themselves in Indonesia. Calhoun (2010) suggested that cultural and linguistic similarity with the Jordanian host community may be the reason why Iraqi refugees were able to integrate well in Jordan

while Somalis were largely segregated. Shared religion and language is also seen to facilitate the formation of positive relationships between Hazaras and the local population in Iran.

A shared belief in Islam is one commonality between Hazara refugees from Afghanistan and the local Indonesian population. However, Hazaras practice Shiism, whereas most Indonesian Muslims practice Sunni Islam. Refugees chose not to attend local mosques or to practice their faith in public for fear of religious discrimination. There have been cases of serious violence and intimidation against Shiite Muslims in Indonesia, as well as anti-Shiite and anti-refugee rhetoric from certain groups in the West Java region (Human Rights Watch 2013b). Bogor was considered by one study to be the least tolerant municipality in the country, with hardline Islamist groups harassing ethnic minorities in the area, and the Mayor of Bogor banning public celebration of Ashura, an important Shiite holiday (Yosephine 2015). In 2015, a group named the National Anti-Shiite Alliance held their inauguration in the city and staged public protests against Shiism (Saudale 2015). As both Shia and refugees, who are often viewed by Indonesians as illegal immigrants, as well as the fact that they are easily identifiable due to their appearance, Hazaras in Indonesia are targets for discrimination, a common source of social exclusion that has been shown to inhibit integration with host communities (Berry 2005; Missbach 2015a).

The poor protection framework in Indonesia is another factor that inhibits integration. It is well established that refugees in transit for extended periods of time are prone to mental health issues due to past trauma and violence, separation from birthplace and uncertainty about the future. This poor mental health state, along with feelings of being an outsider and 'placelessness', negatively impact refugees' ability to integrate (Erdogan 2012). As previously discussed, there are no pathways available for refugees to settle in Indonesia, and as such refugees know their position in Indonesia to be liminal and temporary.

As such, despite the fact that ASRs will live in Indonesia for some years before they can be settled in a new country, from their perspective there is little motivation to invest in a life in Indonesia (UNHCR 2016b).

This is principal among the reasons that many fail to make significant effort to learn Indonesian, which in turn prevents them from forming meaningful relationships with the host community. If refugees were resettled to a country where they had a clear legal status and a future in the country, they would have both a clear incentive to learn the language, as well as support services available to assist them to do so.

## **Conclusion**

It is apparent that wherever they settle around the world, ethnic Hazara refugees, like many immigrants, place importance on building and maintaining co-ethnic communities as a means to develop social capital, which aids their transition to life in the new country and creates a sense of belonging. However, the extent to which they form bonds with the local population, that is, the extent to which they integrate, appears to depend on structural factors within the host country. Cultural and linguistic differences, as well as discrimination, pose an obstacle for refugees in Indonesia, but can be overcome – as seen in places like Australia where Hazara refugees demonstrate positive indicators of integration when afforded a clear legal status, support services and a secure future in the country. Refugees in Indonesia are unable to participate in education and are strictly prohibited from working, and there are no pathways to naturalising in Indonesia. In addition, the poor protection framework and unclear legal status of refugees in the country creates uncertainty and a sense of placelessness. It is then perhaps unsurprising that Hazara refugees have formed somewhat of a segregated community in Puncak, West Java. Despite the fact that Indonesia has lost its function as a transit country for clandestine journeys to Australia since Operation Sovereign

Borders came into effect, this country is still viewed by asylum seekers as little more than a transitional point on the journey to a new life. Refugees' time in Indonesia is spent in a state of *limbo* – between their country of origin, which they were forced to flee, and the promise of a new life in a third country. As such, they either hold strong to the past, by spending time with co-ethnic refugees maintaining traditional customs, or preparing for the future, as explained by the

desire of many refugees to learn English rather than local languages while in Indonesia. The liminality of Hazara refugees in Indonesia leaves them uninvested in their present experience in Indonesia. As such, they do not typically experience meaningful relations with their Indonesian hosts, or take up the behaviours or cultural practices of their neighbours – and find themselves in a community within, but at the same time apart from their Indonesian hosts.

## References

- Abbasi-Shavazi M. J., Glazebrook D., Jamshidiha G., Mahmoudian H. & Sadeghi R.  
 2005 “Return to Afghanistan? A Study of Afghans Living in Mashhad, Islamic Republic of Iran” *Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit*
- Abbasi-Shavazi M. J., Glazebrook D.  
 2006 “Continued Protection, Sustainable Reintegration: Afghan Refugees and Migrants in Iran” *Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit*
- Ajistyatama, W.  
 2014 *Bogor Authorities Evict Asylum Seekers*, Jakarta Post, April 12. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2014/04/12/bogor-authorities-evict-asylum-seekers.html>
- Andhika D.  
 2015 *Bogor Mayor Bima Defends Ashura Ban as Lawsuit Looms*, Jakarta *Globe*, November 23. <http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/bogor-mayor-bima-defends-ashura-ban-lawsuit-looms>
- ABC News  
 2014 *Asylum seekers registered with UNHCR in Indonesia after June no longer eligible for resettlement in Australia, Scott Morrison says*, November. <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2014-11-18/resettlement-path-for-asylum-seekers-in-indonesia-cut-off/5900962>
- Atkinson, R., and Flint, J.  
 2001 *Accessing Hidden and Hard-to-Reach Populations: Snowball Research Strategies*, Social Research Update, University of Surrey
- Bacon E.  
 1951 “The Inquiry into the History of the Hazara Mongols of Afghanistan” *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology* 7, no. 3 (230-247).
- Berry, J.W.  
 2005 “Acculturation: Living successfully in two cultures” *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 29 (697–712)

Burnett K.

- 2013 *Feeling like an outsider: a case study of refugee identity in the Czech Republic*. UNHCR Research Paper No. 251

Calhoun, N.

- 2010 *With a little help from our friends: a participatory assessment of social capital among refugees in Jordan*. UNHCR research paper No. 18. <http://www.unhcr.org/en-au/research/working/4ca0a0109/little-help-friends-participatory-assessment-social-capital-among-refugees.html>

Church World Service

- 2013 *Accessing services in the city: The significance of urban refugee-host relations in Cameroon, Indonesia and Pakistan*. Retrieved from [http://cwsglobal.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/urbanrefugee-fullreport\\_final4-8.pdf](http://cwsglobal.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/urbanrefugee-fullreport_final4-8.pdf)

Canfield, R. L.

- 2004 "New trends among the Hazaras: from "the amity of the wolves" to "the practice of brotherhood" *Iranian Studies*, 37(2), pp 241-262.

Central Intelligence Agency

- 2011 *Afghanistan*. The World Factbook <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/af.html>

Coordinating Ministry for Political, Legal, and Security Affairs (Kemenko Polhukam)

- 2017 *Peran Kemenko Polhukum Dalam Peraturan Presiden (PerPres) No 125 Tahun 2016 tentang penanganan pengungsi dari luar negeri*, Presentation: Brigjen Pol Drs Chairul, SH, MH, Asisten deputi bidang koordinasi penanganan kejahatan transnasional dan kejahatan luar biasa, 9 March 2017

Crouch, M.

- 2012 "Judicial review and religious freedom: The case of Indonesian Ahmadis" *Sydney Law Review* 34(3) 545-572.

Creasy J.

- 2008 *The religious identity of the Hazaras of Afghanistan and modern-day Pakistan*, PhD diss., University of Glasgow. <http://theses.gla.ac.uk/1277/1/2009CreasyMTh.pdf>

Danzer & Yaman

- 2012 *Do Ethnic Enclaves Impede Immigrants' Integration? Evidence from a Quasi-Experimental Social-Interaction Approach*. Institute for the Study of Labor.

Dorransoro, Gilles

- 2012 *Revolution Unending: Afghanistan, 1979 to the Present*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

Emadi H.

- 1997 "The Hazaras and their role in the process of political transformation in Afghanistan", *Central Asian Survey*, 16:3, 363-387
- 2005 *Culture and Customs in Afghanistan*, Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.



Erdogan, Secil.

2012 *Identity Formation and Acculturation: The Case of Karen Refugees in London, Ontario*. PhDdiss., University of Western Ontario. <http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1650&context=etd>

Hasham N.

2015 *Did Tony Abbott stop the boats? New analysis casts doubt on claims*. Sydney Morning Herald, September 25. Retrieved from <http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/did-tony-abbott-stop-the-boats-new-analysis-casts-doubt-on-claims-20150924-gjtwfo.html>

Ibrahimi, N.

2012 "Shift and drift in Hazara ethnic consciousness: The impact of conflict and migration", *CrossRoads Asia Working Paper Series*, no. 5.

Indonesian civil society network for refugee rights (SUAKA)

2014 *Update on refugees and asylum seekers in Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://suaka.or.id/2014/07/23/update-on-refugees-and-asylum-seekers-in-indonesia/>

2015 *Supporting System of Refugee and Asylum Seeker in Indonesia*, retrieved from <http://suaka.or.id/2015/07/09/supporting-system-of-refugee-and-asylum-seekers-in-indonesia/>

Iqbal N. Joyce A., Russo A & Earnest J.

2012 "Resettlement Experiences of Afghan Hazara Female Adolescents: A Case Study from Melbourne, Australia", *International Journal of Population Research*

Glazebrook, D.

2004 "Becoming Mobile After Detention", *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice*, Vol. 48, No. 3, pp. 40-58

2005 "Resettlement after detention: Hazara refugees from Afghanistan in Australia" In *Homeland Wanted: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Refugee Resettlement in the West*, Nova Science Publishers, New York. Pp165-189

Human Rights Watch

2001 'Massacres of Hazaras in Afghanistan', Human Rights Watch Report, Vol. 13, No. 1©. Available on line at: <http://www.hrw.org/reports/2001/afghanistan>

2013a *Confronting Refugee Abuse in Indonesia's Detention Centers*. <https://www.hrw.org/news/2013/07/01/confronting-refugee-abuse-indonesias-detention-centers>

2013b *In Religion's Name - Abuses against Religious Minorities in Indonesia*. <https://www.hrw.org/report/2013/02/28/religions-name/abuses-against-religious-minorities-indonesia>

2014 "We are the Walking Dead" Killings of Shia Hazara in Balochistan, Pakistan. <https://www.hrw.org/report/2014/06/29/we-are-walking-dead/killings-shia-hazara-balochistan-pakistan>

Hugo, G., Tan, G. & Napitupulu C. J.

- 2014 *Indonesia as a Transit Country in Irregular Migration to Australia*, Australian Population and Migration Research Centre, University of Adelaide. [http://www.adelaide.edu.au/apmrc/research/completed/Indonesia\\_Transit\\_Country\\_I\\_MtoA\\_Report.pdf](http://www.adelaide.edu.au/apmrc/research/completed/Indonesia_Transit_Country_I_MtoA_Report.pdf)

International Organisation for Migration (IOM)

- n.d *Community Housing Facilities in Indonesia*. Retrieved from <http://www.iom.or.id/updates/community-housing-facilities-in-indonesia>

Koizumi, K. & Hoffstaedter, G.

2015. *Urban Refugees: Challenges in Protection, Services and Policy*. Routledge.

Kneebone S.,

- 2017 "Australia as a Powerbroker on Refugee Protection in Southeast Asia: The Relationship with Indonesia", *Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees*, Vol 33, No 1

Lange, C., Kamalkhani Z., Baldassar, L.

2007. "Afghan Hazara Refugees in Australia: Constructing Australian Citizens", *Social Identities*, 01/2007, Vol.13(1), pp.31-50

Larson, M.

- 2008 National Geographic. [http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/geopedia/Hazara\\_People](http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/geopedia/Hazara_People)

Landau, L. B.

- n.d *Urban Refugees*, Forced Migration Research Resource, retrieved from <http://www.forcedmigration.org/research-resources/expert-guides/urban-refugees/fmo024.pdf>

Loescher, G. & Miler J.

- 2005 *Protracted Refugee Situations: Domestic and International Security Implications*. International Institute for Strategic Studies.

MacKenzie L., Guntarik O.

- 2015 "Rites of passage: experiences of transition for forced Hazara migrants and refugees in Australia", *Crossings: Journal of Migration & Culture*, Volume 6, No. 1

Mathew P. & Harley T.

- 2014 *Refugee Protection and Regional Cooperation in Southeast Asia*, Australian National University, Australia. Retrieved from [http://www.mcrp.ac.in/WC\\_2015/Reading/D\\_RefugeeProtection.pdf](http://www.mcrp.ac.in/WC_2015/Reading/D_RefugeeProtection.pdf)

McConnachie

- 2014 *Governing Refugees: Justice, Order and Legal Pluralism*, Routledge.

McNevin, A., Missbach, A. and Deddy, M.

- 2016 "The Rationalities of Migration Management: control and subversion in an Indonesia-based counter-smuggling campaign", *International Political Sociology*, 10, 3, 2016: 223-240.

Minority Rights

- 2015 <http://minorityrights.org/minorities/hazaras/>

Missbach, A.

2014a From Darfur to Cipayung: Refugees left stranded. *The Conversation*. Retrieved from <https://theconversation.com/from-darfur-to-cipayung-refugees-are-left-stranded-25034>

2014b Asylum Seekers Stuck in Indonesia. *Jakarta Post*. Retrieved from <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2014/04/04/asylum-seekers-stuck-indonesia.html>

Missbach, A. & Crouch, M

2013 "The criminalisation of people smuggling: legal insights from Indonesia", *Australian Journal of Asian Law* 14, 2, 2013: 119.

Missbach, A.

2015a *Troubled Transit: Asylum Seekers Stuck in Indonesia*. Singapore: Institute of South-East Asian Studies (ISEAS).

2015b "Making a "Career" in People-Smuggling in Indonesia: Protracted Transit, Restricted Mobility and the Lack of Legal Work Rights", *Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 30(2): 423-54. Retrieved from [https://muse.jhu.edu/login?auth=0&type=summary&url=/journals/sojourn\\_jou\\_rnal\\_of\\_social\\_issues\\_in\\_southeast\\_asia/v030/30.2.missbach.html](https://muse.jhu.edu/login?auth=0&type=summary&url=/journals/sojourn_jou_rnal_of_social_issues_in_southeast_asia/v030/30.2.missbach.html)

2015c "Big fears about small boats: How asylum seekers keep upsetting the Indonesia-Australia relationship", in: Tim Lindsey and Dave McRae (eds): *Strangers Next Door? Australia and Indonesia in the Asian Century*, accepted for publication 12 May 2015.

Missbach, A.

2016a "Detaining Asylum Seekers and Refugees in Indonesia", in: Furman, Epps, Lamphear (eds.): *Detaining the Immigrant Other: Global and Translational Issues*, Oxford University Press: 91-104

2016b "People Smuggling in Indonesia: Complexities, (Mis)conceptions and Their Consequences for Sentencing", *Australian Journal of Asian Law*, 17, 2, 2016: 1-25.

Mousavi, Sayed Askar

1997 *The Hazaras of Afghanistan: An Historical, Cultural, Economic and Political Study*, Richmond, Surrey: Curzon Press

Monsutti, A.

2004 "Cooperation, remittances, and kinship among the Hazaras", *Iranian Studies*, Volume 37, 2004 - Issue 2: Afghanistan

Monsutti, A.

2005 *War and Migration: Social Networks and Economic Strategies of the Hazaras of Afghanistan*, Oxon: Taylor and Francis.

2007 "Image of the self, image of the other : social organization and the role of 'Ashura' among the Hazaras of Quetta (Pakistan)", in *The Other Shiites: From the Mediterranean to Central Asia*, ed. Monsutti et al., p. 173-191. Bern, Peter Lang.

Nethery, A., Rafferty-Brown B., & Taylor S.

2012 "Exporting Detention: Australia-funded Immigration Detention in Indonesia", *Journal of Refugee Studies* 26(1): 88-109. Retrieved from <http://jrs.oxfordjournals.org/content/26/1/88.abstract>

Nowell, L.

- 2014 The Hazaras of Dandenong, *The Age*, July 17. <http://www.theage.com.au/victoria/the-hazaras-of-dandenong-20140716-3c1gz.html>

Robinson, W. C.

- 2004 "The Comprehensive Plan of Action for Indochinese Refugees, 1989-1997: Sharing the Burden and Passing the Buck", *Journal of Refugee Studies* 17 (3): 319-333. Retrieved from <http://jrs.oxfordjournals.org/content/17/3/319.full.pdf+html>

Pasandaran C.

- 2013 FPI forces Ahmadiyah Mosque to Close in West Java, *Jakarta Globe*, October 10. Retrieved from <http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/fpi-forces-ahmadiyah-mosque-to-close-in-west-java/>

Putnam, Robert D.

- 2007 "E Pluribus Unum: Diversity and community in the Twenty first Century", *Scandinavian Political Studies*, vol. 30, no. 2: 137-174.

Phillips, Denise

- 2011 "Wounded memory of Hazara refugees from Afghanistan, Remembering and forgetting persecution", *History Australia*, Vol 8, No 2.

The Asia Pacific Refugee Rights Network (APRRN)

- 2014 Report on the 5th Asia Pacific Consultation on Refugee Rights (APCRR5). Retrieved from <http://www.aprrn.info/1/images/APCRR5%20Report%20Final.pdf>

Husain R. & Pearson T.

- 2002 The Hazara People of Afghanistan: A century of Persecution. Retrieved from <http://5mips2008.pbworks.com/f/HazaraBook+copy.pdf>

UNHCR

- 2015a UNHCR Sub-regional profile- South East Asia, Malaysia. Retrieved from <http://www.unhcr.org/pages/49e4884c6.html>

- 2015b UNHCR Global Trends 2014: World at War. Retrieved from <http://www.refworld.org/docid/558292924.html>

- 2016a Monthly Statistical Report Indonesia, March

- 2016b Indonesia Factsheet, February 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.unhcr.org/50001bda9.pdf>

- 2017 Statistical Report. Refugees in Greater Jakarta, July

- 2009 Policy on refugee protection and solutions in urban areas. Retrieved from <http://www.unhcr.org/4ab356ab6.pdf>

Saudale, V.

- 2015 Indonesia's Least Tolerant City Now Home to National Anti-Shiite Movement, *Jakarta Globe*, November 23. Retrieved from <http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/indonesias-least-tolerant-city-now-home-national-anti-shiite-movement/>



Smith, D. M.

- 2014 Indonesia's asylum hub, where desperate hungry people try to bribe their way into detention, *The Guardian*, July 21. Retrieved from <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/jul/21/-sp-indonesias-asylum-hub-where-desperate-hungry-people-try-to-bribe-their-way-into-detention>

Same Skies

- 2014 Indonesia Assessment Report, November. Retrieved from <http://www.sameskies.org/#!projects/c20ko>

a, R. C., Gifford S. M. & Taylor, S.

- 2016 "The myth of transit: the making of a life by asylum seekers and refugees in Indonesia", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol 42. Iss 7

Special Broadcasting Service (SBS)

- 2013 SBS Explainer: Who are the Hazaras <http://www.sbs.com.au/news/article/2013/03/20/explainer-who-are-hazaras>

Tan, N. F.

- 2016 "The Status of Asylum Seekers and Refugees in Indonesia", *International Journal of Refugee Law*, 28 (3): 365-383.

Taylor, S. & Rafferty-Brown, B.

- 2010 "Difficult Journeys: Accessing Refugee Protection in Indonesia", *Monash University Law Review*, Vol. 36, No. 3

World Vision

- 2015 Social cohesion between Syrian Refugees and Urban Host Communities in Lebanon and Jordan. Retrieved from <http://www.wvi.org/disaster-management/publication/social-cohesion-between-syrian-refugees-and-urban-host-communities>

Yosephine, L.

- 2015 Bogor, the most intolerant city in Indonesia, *Jakarta Post*, November 16, 2015. Retrieved from <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/16/bogor-most-intolerant-city-indonesia-says-setara.html>

Zabriskie, P

- 2008 Hazaras: Afghanistan's Outsiders, *National Geographic* 213, no. 2, February. pp 114–135. <http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2008/02/afghanistanhazara/philzabriskie-tex>